

**Summary of Discussion**  
**Broward County Charter Review Commission**  
**Public Safety Subcommittee Meeting # 1**  
**Wednesday, April 11, 2007**  
**Governmental Center-Room 430**  
**3:00 PM- 4:30 PM**

**Members Present:**

Commissioner, Hayward Benson  
Ms. Petey Kaletta  
Dr. Mark Lieberman, Chair  
Mr. Ted Mena  
Mr. Will Trower

**Members Absent:**

Ms. Debby Eisinger, Vice Chair  
Mr. Robert Penezic

**Others Attending:**

Mr. Joe Binevides, President of Broward County Council of Professional Firefighters  
Mr. Ed Curran, Fire Chiefs Association of Broward County  
Mr. Walter Dix, President of the Broward Professional Firefighters  
Ms. Chedley Etienne, Administrative Assistant, CRC  
Mr. Pete Fauerbach, Vice President of the Broward Professional Firefighters  
Ms. Yolanda Grooms, Administrative Specialist, CRC  
Ms. Maria Gross, Assistant Director, CRC  
Phyllis A. King, Transcriber, PKING Consulting, Inc.  
Mr. Joseph Lello, Broward Sheriff Office Fire Rescue  
Ms. Kimberly Maroe, Public Information Broward Commission  
Mr. John McNamara  
Mr. Bruce Moeller, Fire Chief, City of Sunrise  
Mr. Tony Stravino  
Mr. Daniel Sullivan, Director of the Fire Department, Fire Chief  
Mr. Doug Walter  
Patricia G. West, Executive Director

(A copy of the sign-in sheets identifying those present is filed with the supplemental papers to the summary of this Subcommittee Meeting.)

A meeting of the Broward County Charter Review Public Safety Subcommittee “Committee, Subcommittee, or PSSC”, was held at 3:00 p.m. on Wednesday, April 11, 2007 at the Broward County Governmental Center Annex – Room 430, Fort Lauderdale, FL.

## **I Call to Order/Roll Call**

Chair Dr. Mark Lieberman called the meeting to order at 3:04 p.m. The Chair then requested the roll call by Phyllis A. King, PKING Consulting, Inc. Upon completion of the roll, the Chair recognized the presence of a quorum for the record.

The Chair asked the subcommittee to introduce themselves.

The Chair welcomed Mr. Bruce Moeller, former President of the Fire Chiefs’ Association of Broward County, currently the City of Sunrise Fire Chief.

## **II Review List of Issues Assigned to Public Safety Subcommittee**

- A. Emergency Management / Coordination / BSO**
- B. Fire Rescue Coordination**
- C. Firefighter Minimum Standards**
- D. Provide Accountability for Existing Charter Amendment for Firefighters**
- E. Intergovernmental Interaction in Emergencies**

## **III. Establish Priorities**

The Chair started to review the list of assigned issues, he stated to Mr. Moeller that his opinion would be appreciated, and asked for an in-depth background so he could educate the subcommittee on the state of Emergency Services in Broward County.

He then opened the floor for discussion of the first issue, ***Emergency Management/Coordination / BSO.***

Ms. West stated that she does think the Charter amendment addresses Firefighters specifically, but there’s a Charter amendment that outlines the Fire Rescue Council.

Mr. Mena expressed his concern with the lack of BSO as a part of the PSSC's issues list.

The Chair explained that they had a big committee meeting, looked at all the issues, and had discussions, and the Police Department BSO never came up as an issue. He further stated that he was not sure if they can bring it up at this point. The Chair asked Ms. West for her opinion.

Ms. West stated that Mr. Mena should mention to the CRC Chair that it is a concern; she added that he could bring the issue before the whole Commission.

The Chair stated that it does look like we are focusing on Fire Rescue; if there is an issue, the subcommittee could discuss it and bring it to the whole committee.

Mr. Mena stated that he mentioned the issue so that it will go on record that the subcommittee did address that concern, that if a County is having a major emergency, the police department should be coordinating with Fire Rescue.

The Chair pointed out that coordinating BSO with Fire Rescue is under issue A.

Mr. Mena stated that BSO is the County and some Cities have their own police department, it is not just BSO, it is all police departments.

Ms. West asked should that issue be placed under E (Intergovernmental Interaction in Emergencies).

Mr. Mena stated that hurricanes in Broward County are a big problem; and that the subcommittee should be very concerned about another hurricane hit, like Wilma. Mr. Mena added that from personal experience in Coral Springs, it wiped out a third of their trees, and it was a disaster in that area. He stated that the fire department could not travel through the streets, and the police department had to be there to assist them in order to clear the streets and traffic. Mr. Mena suggested that these are issues that the subcommittee should recommend be added to the Charter if it is not being addressed at this point.

The Chair stated that they would address that issue under Emergency Management / Coordination/ BSO and added that the subcommittee should have experts from the Emergency Operations Agency speak to the subcommittee.

The Chair asked what would go under Intergovernmental Interaction in Emergencies.

Ms. West replied that when there are emergencies the different municipalities coordinated utilizing varied strategies. She referred to the various speakers during the MESC that indicated when there are emergencies, there is chaos. Ms. West stated that it would be great to have better coordination among the 31 cities and the county.

Mr. Mena stated that in order to have coordination between cities they have to be on the same radio frequency; he suggested a program, or set- up, so that Sunrise can talk to Lauderhill on the same frequency.

Ms. West stated that earlier today, Mr. Binevides spoke about 26 Cities that are collaborating on the radio system, but they have more work to do.

Mr. Mena asked would the subcommittee be able to ask the guest questions when they are finished?

The Chair replied yes.

**IV. Guest Speaker: Bruce Moeller-Fire Chiefs' Association of Broward County /Fire Rescue Issues**

Mr. Moeller stated the Federal Government has no role in running local Fire Rescue Agencies, he added that when you talk about the roles of government, Federal, State and then Local level they differentiate between the County and the Cities. He stated that it is important to get some context on that. Mr. Moeller stated that currently he is Fire Chief for the City of Sunrise and has been for 10 years and that he is here today representing the Fire Chiefs Association of Broward County, which is their membership association that represents all the Fire Service Agencies in the County. Mr. Moeller stated that prior to that, he was the Fire Chief and Director for Broward County Rescue which was the predecessor agency to the Sheriff's Office. ; He served on the department of Fire Rescue and Emergency Services from 1990-1992, then from 1992-1997, served as the County's Director. He has had the chance to work from the County perspective and a Municipal perspective in looking at Fire Rescue issues. Throughout the County there are a couple of recurring themes that go through that which I will talk about Some are the issues that the subcommittee has heard about and are tasked to review . Mr. Moeller stated there are many different groups that participate in Fire Rescue Services besides at the local level, and right now he believes we have 19 agencies that are providing Fire Rescue Services, which include the Broward Sheriff's Office Fire Rescues and Emergency Services Department, plus 18

Municipalities that provide Fire Rescue Services. Mr. Moeller added that some communities like those of the City of Margate, provide Fire protection under contract to Coconut Creek, the City of Coral Springs and services to Parkland. He stated that the Sheriff's Office has contracts in a number of communities. Mr. Moeller stated that he is going to provide the subcommittee an objective perspective on the structure of Fire Services; he added that the International Fire Chiefs includes the U.S. Fire Administration (Department of Homeland Security/ FEMA) and several other groups. He mentioned the most well known group is the National Fire Protection Association (NFPA) and they are well involved in Fire Safety issues; they write fire codes that deal with all sorts of issues. Mr. Moeller stated that he provided the subcommittee with a copy of the 2001 FTA 17.10 which is a document that will be mentioned frequently today. He explained that the NFPA is a consensus standard making organization that has no authority to promulgate formal rules and regulation that are binding on any Governmental entity; they are acknowledged and accepted as a significant source of information for the Fire Service. Mr. Moeller also added that the Fire Protection Code NFPA 1 is actually the code for Florida.

Mr. Moeller reviewed NFPA Codes, and provided a hardcopy for members of the subcommittee. He stated that Emergency Medical Services also has a statutory provision of the Association requiring anyone that is a Paramedic or EMT (Emergency Medical Technician) in the State of Florida to be credentialed by the State. He further stated that in the area of Fire and EMS there are statutes and rules. There is also the Professional Florida Fire Chief Association that has a National Association and State Association. He advised that the State Association works closely with the Division of Emergency Management and the State's Fire Marshalls Office. He addressed the issues dealing with emergency management and coordination. On the State level, there is the Division of Emergency Management, at the County level, its Broward County's Emergency Management Agency and they serve a traditional emergency management function. Mr. Moeller stated that most cities do not have dedicated emergency management functions. Many of the Fire Chiefs in this room as well as himself are in fact, the Emergency Manager of their City. In his community, he's the Emergency Manager. Emergency management functions to a large degree are taking existing resources that the community has, then reassembles them into a virtual organization in order to respond to a man-made or natural disaster that may impact the community. Mr. Moeller informed everyone that the Federal Government has a National Response Plan (NIMS) National Incident Management System where they talk about how we manage those events; he added that Florida is known for having an aggressive program. For instance, we have a State Emergency Response Plan that brings in Law

Enforcement and Public Health, Fire Rescue, EMS, and myriad entities. Mr. Moeller distributed the State's Field Operations Guide for that plan, which was written by the Chief of Davie, Julie Downing. He further stated that the State Plan is in place for every municipality in Broward; each has signed an agreement with the State of Florida to follow that plan. He added that the Counties' plans derived from that, and it allows us to get reimbursements. He stated that this document is sort of a checklist and a sheet of how we operate what things we do and don't do during an emergency. Mr. Moeller explained that there is a lot of coordination at the local level. (He distributed a membership listing of the Fire Chiefs Association).. Mr. Moeller stated that each of the Cities in Broward County participates in a Countywide Mutual Aide System. Besides the State-wide agreement, we also have a County Mutual Aide System that requires each City to provide systems to one another in case of a serious incident. His agency sometimes runs over into Lauderhill, and their document was last executed in 1985. He explained that in his Community, they have five stations which are station numbers: 39,59,72,83 and 92. They jump around because in Broward County, they have numbered all of the fire stations to the best of their ability. He advised the subcommittee that the first station that was built in Dania Beach, Fire Station number 1, the second station is in Fort Lauderdale, Fire Station number 2 and it goes on and on. Mr. Moeller explained the reason for that is, if we are running Mutual Aide and he needs an engine from Lauderhill talking to an engine from Sunrise, he can't have engine 1 to engine 1, it would not work. He explained that is why the numbers are different throughout the County, so that when they talk to each other on a single radio channel, they can do so without confusing one another. Mr. Moeller distributed a book called Florida Regional Common EMS Protocols, which was published out of M.A... He added that this book was published a few years ago and it is in revision. The book was written by EMS and Physicians here in Broward County and was done under the supervision and guidance of the Fire Chief Association of Broward County. He advised the subcommittee that this book is sold nationally and they have sold about fourteen hundred (1400) copies of this book. Paramedics addressing the Medical Treatment Protocols for injuries or illness are using this book. He suggested that if someone moves from one end of the County to the other, they should be getting the same level of service. Mr. Moeller explained that each of the Cities has a companion City that participates in Broward's Emergency Operations Center, (EOC). On the second floor, they have what they refer to as the 'War Room' where the operations occur when we have a disaster. He explained that each municipality has a seat at that location. After Hurricane Wilma, they realized that the coordination was not strong as a result, the Fire Chiefs and the Police Chiefs created a 'White Paper' that they provided to the County Administrator and talked

about some of the areas where there are gaps. They shared that with the County in an attempt to strengthen that process. Mr. Moeller indicated that every Fire Rescue Agency in Broward County has the capability to communicate on a series of 13 channels that are shared, Most of the agencies have 800 radio trunk systems, and some Cities have their own,. For example, the City of Fort Lauderdale or in the case of Sunrise, where they utilize the County's radio system, but they have their own channels. During an incident they however, can quickly patch together those channels to coordinate. Mr. Moeller added that they have 13 talk groups that are there just for Fire, there is a separate system with 13 talk groups that have channels for Law Enforcement. He advised that they have the capability with two components. The first component -- does the technology exist? -- Can we talk to one another, the second component is the operational stuff; he stated that those are issues we continue to work on. Mr. Moeller stated that Palm Beach County is going through many of the issues that Broward County has been through in the past 10 or 15 years with Regional Communication and Coordinating Fire Rescue Response. He stated that Palm Beach has attempted to address issues such as staffing, training, certification, communication, and response time performance. Mr. Moeller stated that he just wanted to give the subcommittee an overview and hope that he did a good job, and if anyone has any questions, he would try to provide the correct answer to them.

**[ End of Speaker ]**

The Chair thanked Mr. Moeller for the presentation; He commented that he was sure that there are many questions. The Chair again thanked Mr. Moeller for the books and information he provided.

The Chair suggested that the subcommittee go around the room with questions.

Mr. Mena asked Mr. Moeller what he thinks the number one priority the CRC full Committee should hear from the Firefighters.

Mr. Moeller replied that the question was more difficult for him to answer because it goes into the category of Governance issues and it becomes a policy piece which the Charter is going to have to look at as to whether there should be a change. It is an appropriate role for the Charter Review Commission to decide to require or mandate certain performance or certain elements to municipalities. Mr. Moeller explained that it comes down to his opinion in order for him to

answer that question; and that is why he is not going to answer the question, because everyone has his or her own opinion.

The Chair stated that he would be interested in Mr. Moeller's opinion; and further stated that the subcommittee is going to hear from different sides and hear different opinions.

Mr. Moeller replied that he feels it is important for each community to decide the level of services, as we move forward in the near term with what is happening in the legislature, and with the issues of property tax and the struggles that the Commissioners both the County Commission and the City Commissioners are going to have to balance funding issues.

Ms. Kaletta asked who pays the assisting municipality.

Mr. Moeller explained that each individual community participating, has agreed that they will provide assistance for their neighbor and they will get the same back. The exception is, if we damage their equipment, that each agency that participates, bares it own cost.

Ms. Kaletta asked Mr. Moeller if that system balances out.

Mr. Moeller replied that there are some minimum requirements in the current Mutual Aide yes, but there is a difference between them. He advised that all the municipalities participate in a mutual aide agreement. Automatic Aide is a little different from Mutual Aide whereby two communities next to each other agree that they get an activated fire alarm. Before it exceeds capability, they are going to agree to respond automatically.

Ms. Kaletta asked how Mutual Aide worked.

Mr. Moeller stated that there are some Minimum Standard Requirements, when I need assistance under Mutual Aide, I can pick up the phone and everyone who has one of those phones will hear you and they will say Sunrise to Broward County, I need three engines, then they will dispatch those resources to come and assist.

Mr. Benson read "Section 5.03 A" of the Charter to the subcommittee, and explained that the CRC was informed by a speaker today about a Community Systems mismatch. He asked for suggestions of improvement to the system.

Mr. Moeller commented on the paragraph Mr. Benson read regarding the "County shall provide a communication infrastructure which would provide and allow for certain things"; he stated that he believes that the infrastructure exists. Broward County has constructed a 800 mhz trunk radio system with 28 channels, and that every Fire Rescue provider has the capability to talk on that. Mr. Moeller suggested that municipalities, who do not have 800 MHz, should move to it. He stated that it is a policy question; does the County want to dictate how the nearest unit response occurs. He further added, that generally when two communities decide to participate, it is done between a local agreement between those two entities. Mr. Moeller stated that CAD (Computer Aide Dispatch) is a different system and everyone needs to be on the same system.

Dr. Lieberman stated with regard to the CAD, that Mr. Benavides of the Fire Rescue Council spoke to the CRC and mentioned that they are working toward a unified system. He asked Mr. Moeller should that be something they need to work towards.

The Chair stated that it is a 30 million dollar project that they are trying to coordinate between the Cities for the CAD system.

Mr. Moeller stated that there are a few areas to tie into the radio and then the CAD.

The Chair asked if this system will be able to look at all areas.

Mr. Moeller stated that the County continues to work on redefining the CAD system for the future, also getting Cities to participate, and funding. Mr. Moeller added that they need to ensure from a regional perspective infrastructure that CAD is funded.

Ms. West asked Mr. Moeller what the CAD system does.

Mr. Moeller replied that when someone calls 911, two questions are asked, first being what is the incident and then where are you. By putting those two pieces of information into the system, the computer recommends what resources to send, either Law Enforcement, or Fire and EMS, and which unit to send.

Mr. Benson asked who controls this system.

Mr. Moeller replied that each dispatch controls their own center; Broward County has the largest dispatch center.

The Chair stated that this system is what the County needs, but getting the Cities to agree is going to be difficult.

Mr. Moeller stated that every City participates in Mutual Aide but does not participate in Automatic Aide.; Mutual aide is when a municipality asks for help vs. automatic aide, which is programmed in.

The Chair asked, if an engine or unit has to leave the County for Trauma and the other unit is tied up and there is a gap in service, would they know this automatically or would they have to be contacted.

Mr. Moeller stated that if they call another jurisdiction because they are short, and they don't have enough resources, then that will be Mutual Aide.

The Chair asked that with the way the system is now, with these agreements, is the system adequate?

Mr. Moeller replied that he believes that the Mutual Aide is adequate, but the Automatic Aide needs more work. He added that his association has drafted a model template for the Automatic Aide agreement.

The Chair stated if the Fire Rescue Council had more authority to institute the Automatic Aide with the municipalities, would getting the dispatch system be something that we need for the County. He then asked Mr. Moeller for his opinion on whether that should be something the County is striving for.

Mr. Moeller stated that he is not speaking on behalf of the Council; however, his opinion is that of which having the ability to get the County to fully fund that infrastructure (CAD), and to make sure that there is the capacity for all agencies to participate.

Ms. Kaletta stated that she does not think the Charter should mandate details, but should be a guiding light within the Communities. Ms. Kaletta asked why are the Cities not participating, and what are the shortcomings that are keeping this from happening.

Mr. Moeller replied that there are two issues, Technology and Governmental between the joining communities.

Ms. Kaletta asked how much is it Home Rule, you don't want anyone else telling you what to do?

Mr. Moeller replied that Broward County has made significant strides from when he came here 17 years ago with the radio communications, that we have in our ability to communicate. Mr. Moeller stated that every Fire Engine can talk to one another in Broward County, but there are other factors keeping it from working properly. Mr. Moeller added that there must be a funding component; he further stated that there is in place a Fire Rescue Council that is tasked with looking at these issues.

Mr. Benson waived his questions.

Mr. Trower asked if Mr. Moeller could define communications infrastructure.

Mr. Moeller explained that the Fire Rescue Council has looked at two dominions, which are radio and computer component.

Mr. Trower asked if anyone has discussed what this means.

Mr. Moeller stated that he was closely involved in the process the last time the Charter Review Commission met as a whole, and this language was crafted near the end of the process. Mr. Moeller stated that the Charter Review Commission did not have as much in-depth of an explanation of this process (communication radio vs. communication CAD); the technology level of detail was not discussed.

Mr. Trower stated that the following census implies that the computer system expansion is necessary, and that one of the issues that the subcommittee needs to look at is to clarify the language of Section 5.03.

Mr. Moeller explained that generally the way it has been done, is the County funds from the Radio Council and the dispatch sits back to the big tower, and the individual Cities have historically funded what is in our hands for the Fire/ Police Officers.

Mr. Trower asked if the County hasn't funded the radios.

Mr. Moeller explained that the County hasn't funded the field equipment.

Mr. Trower asked if it now becomes a local City issue, as to whether they can hook into the existing regional communication system.

Mr. Moeller stated that most of these Cities already have their own system and CAD. Mr. Moeller stated that if a City wants to go even, if the County were to pay for certain elements of it such as the CAD and radio, there are still other components.

The Chair stated that he assumed that is in the 40 million dollar cost, he asked has that been approved.

Mr. Moeller replied that the 40 million dollar is simply the radio system.

The Chair asked what the cost would be for the CAD system.

Mr. Moeller replied that he is not sure on the numbers, which BSO or Broward County would know.

Mr. Trower asked if the radio system supports Law Enforcement as well.

Mr. Moeller answered yes and most are on the Smart Zone.

Mr. Benavides stated that they are looking at a 40 million dollar program that has been in place, and added that the issue of the funding is the AVL, Vehicle Locators, Streaming Video and Computers which looks like it would be a 30 million dollar add on. Mr. Benavides stated that the County has made a suggestion that they want the Cities to bear that and the maintenance of those programs. He commented that there is an extra 30 million dollars required to put the full infrastructure in place, at that time, then the Cities will move on to a new place of compatibility.

Mr. Trower stated if the County came up with the money for that for the Cities, they still wouldn't be compatible because they will now have to convert other systems.

Mr. Moeller replied yes, the Cities would have to convert other systems.

Mr. Benson stated that he does not believe that adequate definitions were provided with regard to Section 5.03. He suggested that clarification be provided by Public Safety Subcommittee.

Mr. Moeller stated that the term they use is Demarcation- where is the line between the County and Municipality.

Ms. West asked what they call the funds, where if you build something new and you also have a contingency fund.

Mr. Trower replied that it is called Funded Depreciation.

The Chair stated that he is a little confused about the 30-40 million dollars for the radio system; he asked if that is a work in progress.

Mr. Moeller replied that 40 million has been spent historically, and it will require an additional 30-40 million.

The Chair asked if the 30 million will give them the system that would allow everyone to communicate.

Mr. Benavides replied for 5 years.

The Chair requested the original 5.03 draft from the pervious CRC.

Mr. Mena asked for confirmation that the problem is Communication between all of the services. He suggested that they should include Law Enforcement, because the Cities have an emergency situation where the Fire Department is going to do it all alone; they are going to need Law Enforcement and they are going to need to communicate.

The Chair advised Mr. Mena that they have ten minutes left and he wanted to hear another speaker.

Mr. Mena stated that he wants to make sure that the subcommittee is on the right track as to what direction the Fire Rescue people are asking us to communicate with the CRC.

The Chair gave Mr. Benavides the floor.

Mr. Benavides explained that the municipalities have a standard level of Service County-wide based on an independent funding source to facilitate that the closest unit responds to all fire and medical emergencies through a coordinated communication system. Mr. Benavides stated that

if the Firefighters have a call, they should send the same amount of response to all calls, no matter where they are. He added that there should be no agreement; there should be criteria that we will respond to this equipment's response. There should be no level of service that we can't address. Mr. Benavides stated if you put an independent military funding source in place and make it user friendly to the Cities, they will build an acceptable shell and allow for the funding to get in place, thereby creating a standard level of services. Mr. Benavides stated that County-wide Cities may be losing anywhere from 80-100 million off the top; he suggested that they should have an open discussion and come up with a plan.

Mr. Mena asked Mr. Benavides for the record, clarify **we / our** program.

Mr. Benavides clarified himself, **The Broward County Council of Professional Firefighters**; he added that 15 years ago they came to the table with a plan, which was this type of a program.

**[End of Speaker]**

The Chair invited Mr. Benavides back for another meeting. Mayor Cooper will also be invited to return.

## **V. Review Dates of Upcoming Meetings**

A discussion regarding the next meeting time took place.

The subcommittee agreed to schedule the next meeting via e-mail.

## **VI Other Business**

Mr. Mena requested an invite for Law Enforcement.

Mr. Trower asked Mr. Benavides for something in writing that they have submitted.

Mr. Benavides stated that he would provide information or a copy of the plan.

Ms. Kaletta asked how Homeowner's Insurance is affected by distance from the Fire Station.

Mr. Moeller stated that there is an organization called the Insurance Services Office which is a voluntary process that insurance agencies participate in. He advised that Insurance companies use ratings to determine the insurance premium rates for the Fire Protection Component. Mr. Moeller added that many insurance companies rate by classification; therefore if you are a class 1, 2 or 3 department, they will give you the same rate.

Mr. Benson stated that the operative phrase is '*coordinated communications system*'. He suggested that the subcommittee ask an Attorney to investigate components as to whether a funding system can be placed in the Charter.

Mr. Benavides replied that it requires a dual referendum.

#### **VII Public Comment**

None

#### **VIII Adjournment**

There being no further discussion and no public comment the meeting was adjourned at 4:30pm

The minutes of this meeting are recorded on CRC-PSSC CD # 4.11.07 (BCGV CTR)