

**Unincorporated Broward County  
Annexation Study**

**Pine Island Ridge**

**Executive Summary**

The Pine Island Ridge annexation study was written in response to Broward County’s goal that, by the year 2010, all unincorporated neighborhoods within the County must be annexed or become incorporated into their own municipality. The study represents an extensive study of three scenarios for Pine Island Ridge. One such scenario examines incorporating Pine Island Ridge into its own municipality, a second examines annexation by the Town of Davie, and a third examines annexation by the City of Plantation. This in-depth study compares demographic data, tax fee and assessment rates, land use and zoning, fiscal impacts, capital improvement programs, level of service, fire, police and EMS, municipal staff and services, and public policy for Pine Island Ridge and the two adjacent municipalities—Plantation and Davie--so that the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood can best decide which scenario is best for their needs.

**Incorporation Scenario**

This section of the study examines the viability of incorporation. The following is an analysis of the cost comparison (representing all taxes and fees) among the City of Plantation, the Town of Davie and unincorporated Broward County. Considering the analysis of the incorporation of Pine Island Ridge into a new City, a comparison of the costs to the individual household has been included. The following table adds the cost comparison for the new City alternative to the analysis for the City of Plantation, the Town of Davie and Broward County.

***Comparison Of Annual Costs/Household  
Annexation And Incorporation Alternatives  
Condominiums***

| <b>Annual Costs Assessed Value*</b> | <b>Study Areas Broward County</b> | <b>City of Plantation</b> | <b>Town of Davie</b> | <b>New City Alternative</b> |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|
| \$ 25,000                           | \$ 465.47                         | \$ 239.25                 | \$ 278.54            | \$ 465.47                   |
| \$ 50,000                           | \$ 518.82                         | \$ 328.95                 | \$ 428.76            | \$ 808.47                   |
| \$ 75,000                           | \$ 572.17                         | \$ 418.65                 | \$ 578.99            | \$1,151.47                  |
| \$100,000                           | \$ 625.52                         | \$ 508.35                 | \$ 729.21            | \$1,494.47                  |
| \$125,000                           | \$ 678.87                         | \$ 598.05                 | \$ 879.43            | \$1,837.47                  |
| \$150,000                           | \$ 732.22                         | \$ 687.75                 | \$1,029.65           | \$2,180.47                  |
| \$175,000                           | \$ 785.57                         | \$ 777.45                 | \$1,179.88           | \$2,523.47                  |
| \$200,000                           | \$ 838.92                         | \$ 867.15                 | \$1,330.10           | \$2,866.47                  |

\* Ad valorem taxes are levied on Taxable Value which is defined as Assessed Value minus Exemptions.

Note: Assumes \$25,000 Homestead Exemption

Source: PMG Associates, Inc.

The above table demonstrates that the new City alternative will generate costs per household that are higher than the existing charges for Broward County, the Town of Davie and the City of Plantation. In addition, the ad valorem tax rate that would be required for the new City exceeds the limitations in the State Statutes.

***Description of Expenditures By Operational Department***

The next step in the incorporation scenario was to analyze operational expenses estimated for the level of service anticipated in the first year of operation (FY 99/00) and was based on the review of annual budgets of varying municipalities throughout South Florida. Examination of the budgets revealed a range of costs for the municipalities based on size and the nature of the community. The annual cost figure was based on this review. The new City will not be required to provide as extensive a level of service as other municipalities of similar size.

|                            |           |              |
|----------------------------|-----------|--------------|
| Commission/Council         | Cost      | \$ 35,000    |
|                            | Personnel | 5            |
| City Manager               | Cost      | \$ 200,000   |
|                            | Personnel | 2            |
| City Clerk                 | Cost      | \$ 150,000   |
|                            | Personnel | 2            |
| Finance Department         | Cost      | \$ 200,000   |
|                            | Personnel | 2            |
| Purchasing                 | Cost      | \$ 150,000   |
|                            | Personnel | 2            |
| City Attorney              | Cost      | \$ 100,000   |
|                            | Personnel | 2            |
| Planning/Zoning Department | Cost      | \$ 100,000   |
|                            | Personnel | 2            |
| Public Works               | Cost      | \$ 150,000   |
|                            | Personnel | 3            |
| Parks and Recreation       | Cost      | \$ 100,000   |
|                            | Personnel | 2            |
| Maintenance                | Cost      | \$ 150,000   |
|                            | Personnel | 2            |
| Police Services            | Cost      | \$ 1,100,000 |
|                            | Personnel | 12           |

Vehicles: Typically, the Broward Sheriff's Office has a policy that Deputy Sheriffs take home service vehicles. This policy leads to an assumption that there is one vehicle for each of the 12 personnel listed above. All costs, including the capital and operating cost of the vehicles, are included in the total cost amount listed above.

*Capital Costs:*

The following is a list of capital costs for major expenditures not included under small expenditures in the operating budget and an estimated cost to cover them. These expenditures are necessary in order to provide the necessary services to the new City.

- City Building and personnel offices
- 5 acres of parks
- Equipment for staff

*Total annual cost allocation:* \$150,000

These capital costs are estimated on an annual basis. It is anticipated that these costs will be amortized over 10 years.

*Incorporation Costs*

Several items are required for the new City and are added to the budgets for the first three years. These are special services that are likely to be completed by outside vendors. The cost for these services will be the same under both alternatives.

|  |           |             |
|--|-----------|-------------|
| Legal Costs - Incorporation                          | \$100,000 | Year 1      |
| Comprehensive Plan/Land Development Code/Zoning Code | \$250,000 | Years 2 & 3 |

*Demographic Data*

The demographic data compares population, housing and employment characteristics of Pine Island Ridge, the Town of Davie and the City of Plantation. This section of the study showed that Pine Island Ridge residents are mostly well-educated, retired homeowners and share similar characteristics with both the Town of Davie and the City of Plantation.

**Population by Age and Gender**

| Population Age & Gender | Pine Island Ridge |       | Town of Davie |        | City of Plantation |        |
|-------------------------|-------------------|-------|---------------|--------|--------------------|--------|
|                         | %                 | Count | %             | Count  | %                  | Count  |
| 0 - 4                   | 4.5%              | 234   | 18.3%         | 3,904  | 5.5%               | 3,641  |
| 5 - 17                  | 8.6%              | 450   | 16.6%         | 7,854  | 15.6%              | 10,407 |
| 18 - 24                 | 32.2%             | 1,688 | 47.9%         | 22,599 | 42.4%              | 28,301 |
| 45 - 64                 | 24.8%             | 1,302 | 18.3%         | 8,630  | 22.1%              | 14,756 |
| 64+                     | 29.9%             | 1,570 | 9.0%          | 4,230  | 14.4%              | 9,587  |
| Females                 | 54.5%             | 2,856 | 51.1%         | 24,120 | 52.1%              | 34,725 |
| Males                   | 45.5%             | 2,388 | 48.9%         | 23,097 | 47.9%              | 31,967 |
| TOTAL                   | 100.0%            | 5,244 | 100.0%        | 47,217 | 100.0%             | 66,692 |

Source: 1990 U.S. Bureau of the Census, Broward County Planning Information Technology Division

The largest category of residents in Pine Island Ridge are 18-24 compared to the Town of Davie and the City of Plantation with the largest % of residents in the same category.

## Employment Characteristics

| Employment Status | Study Areas       |               |                    |        |       |        |
|-------------------|-------------------|---------------|--------------------|--------|-------|--------|
|                   | Pine Island Ridge | Town of Davie | City of Plantation |        |       |        |
| Employed Female   | 49.4%             | 1,340         | 44.2%              | 12,141 | 44.2% | 16,659 |
| Employed Male     | 46.9%             | 1,271         | 50.6%              | 13,764 | 51.9% | 19,590 |
| Total Employed    |                   | 2,611         |                    | 25,905 |       | 36,249 |
| Unemployed Female | 2.1%              | 57            | 1.9%               | 514    | 1.8%  | 674    |
| Unemployed Male   | 1.6%              | 43            | 2.8%               | 756    | 2.1%  | 803    |

Source: 1990 U. s. Bureau of the Census

Pine Island Ridge has the lowest unemployment compared to the Town of Davie and the City of Plantation, but the discrepancy between the neighborhood and each municipality is marginal. The same is true for the percentage of employed males and females. Therefore, all three study areas have comparable employment and unemployment rates.

## Income Analysis

| Household Income Range | Study Areas       |               |                    |
|------------------------|-------------------|---------------|--------------------|
|                        | Pine Island Ridge | Town of Davie | City of Plantation |
| Less Than \$5,000      | 131 (5.0%)        | 633 (3.6%)    | 567 (2.1%)         |
| \$5,000 - \$14,999     | 381 (14.6%)       | 2081 (11.7%)  | 2438 (9.2%)        |
| \$15,000 - \$24,999    | 554 (21.3%)       | 2717 (15.3%)  | 3647 (13.7%)       |
| \$25,000 - \$49,999    | 862 (33.1%)       | 6577 (37.0%)  | 8959 (33.7%)       |
| \$50,000 - \$74,999    | 456 (17.5%)       | 3612 (20.3%)  | 6,051 (22.8%)      |
| \$75,000 - \$99,999    | 142 (5.5%)        | 1267 (7.1%)   | 2425 (9.1%)        |
| Greater Than \$99,999  | 78 (3.0%)         | 879 (4.9%)    | 24,65 (9.3%)       |

Source: 1990 U.S. Bureau of the Census

Household income, as reported in the 1990 U.S. Bureau of the Census, was notably lower in Pine Island Ridge (\$29,705) than in the Town of Davie (\$36,843) or the City of Plantation (\$41,832).

## Housing Occupancy

| Housing Occupancy | Study Areas       |                |                    |
|-------------------|-------------------|----------------|--------------------|
|                   | Pine Island Ridge | Town of Davie  | City of Plantation |
| Total Units, 1990 | 3193              | 19,889         | 29,399             |
| Vacant            | 582 (18.2%)       | 1,982 (10.0%)  | 2,910 (9.9%)       |
| Seasonal          | 400 (12.5%)       | 700 (3.5%)     | 622 (2.1%)         |
| Occupied Units    | 2611              | 17,907         | 26,489             |
| Owner Occupied    | 1882 (58.9%)      | 13,220 (73.8%) | 19,232 (72.6%)     |
| Renter Occupied   | 729 (22.8%)       | 4,687 (26%)    | 7,257 (27.4%)      |

Source: 1990 U.S. Bureau of the Census

Note that Seasonal housing is a percent of total housing (may include both occupied and vacant units)

While housing occupancy rates between the City of Plantation and the Town of Davie were very similar, Pine Island Ridge demonstrates notable differences. Pine Island Ridge's 12.5% of seasonal housing units is remarkably higher than the Town of Davie's 3.5% or the City of Plantation's 2.1%. Pine Island Ridge has a lower owner occupied housing rate and a much higher percentage of vacant housing.

### Housing Type

| Housing Type           | Study Areas       |               |                    |
|------------------------|-------------------|---------------|--------------------|
|                        | Pine Island Ridge | Town of Davie | City of Plantation |
| Single-Family Detached | 287 (9.0%)        | 7,754 (39.0%) | 13,900 (47.3%)     |
| Single-Family Attached | 289 (9.1%)        | 3,037 (15.3%) | 3,718 (12.6%)      |
| Duplex                 | 4 (0.1%)          | 322 (1.6%)    | 182 (0.6%)         |
| Multi Family           | 2,601 (81.5%)     | 5,373 (27.0%) | 10,835 (36.9%)     |
| Mobile Homes and Other | 12 (0.4%)         | 3,403 (17.1%) | 764 (3%)           |
| <b>TOTAL</b>           | <b>3,193</b>      | <b>19,889</b> | <b>29,399</b>      |

Source: US Census, 1990.

The housing stock in each of the three communities varies widely. Pine Island Ridge has fewer single-family housing units, particularly detached units. Conversely, Pine Island Ridge has a significantly larger share of multifamily housing than do the other communities.

### Housing Value

| Housing Values        | Study Areas       |               |                    |
|-----------------------|-------------------|---------------|--------------------|
|                       | Pine Island Ridge | Town of Davie | City of Plantation |
| \$0-\$19,999          | 0 (0.0%)          | 11 (0.1%)     | 7 (0.0%)           |
| \$20,000 - \$29,999   | 0 (0.0%)          | 15 (0.2%)     | 9 (0.1%)           |
| \$30,000 - \$39,999   | 0 (0.0%)          | 65 (0.7%)     | 29 (0.2%)          |
| \$40,000 - \$49,999   | 1 (0.2%)          | 188 (2.1%)    | 113 (0.8%)         |
| \$50,000 - \$74,999   | 109 (26.1%)       | 1853 (21.0%)  | 1270 (8.8%)        |
| \$75,000 - \$99,999   | 75 (18.0%)        | 1924 (21.8%)  | 2999 (20.7%)       |
| \$100,000 - \$124,999 | 4 (1.0%)          | 1325 (15.0%)  | 2323 (16.0%)       |
| \$125,000 - \$149,999 | 30 (7.2%)         | 1200 (13.6%)  | 2434 (16.8%)       |
| \$150,000 - \$199,999 | 147 (35.3%)       | 1220 (13.8%)  | 2954 (20.4%)       |
| \$200,000 - \$299,999 | 48 (11.5%)        | 716 (8.1%)    | 1791 (12.4%)       |
| \$300,000 or More     | 3 (0.7%)          | 296 (3.4%)    | 571 (3.9%)         |

Source: 1990 Census

Housing values in Pine Island Ridge most closely resemble the City of Plantation. Most housing in Pine Island Ridge is between \$50,000 and \$300,000 as is the case in the City of Plantation and the Town of Davie.

## **Land Use and Zoning**

Pine Island Ridge has been rezoned as a Planned Development District (PDD) and is subject to compliance with the Master Development Plan and the rezoning ordinance. In addition, the Final Order of the bankruptcy court, issued in 1978, constitutes the bulk of the rezoning ordinance and Master Development Plan. Because the Final Order controls this area, rezoning in either municipality would not affect this control. The Order further limits changes in density or unit mix subject to the Court's approval. Additionally, the restrictive covenants on the Pine Island Ridge conservation area will ensure the Ridge is preserved and not developed. This is the only vacant land within the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood.

This study also compares general regulations including accessory units and structures, parking large vehicles in residential neighborhoods, fences, walls and hedges, number and types of permitted pets, and locating adult facilities. It found that both the Town of Davie and the City of Plantation permit livestock where Broward County does not, and that Broward County restrictions on adult uses are the most lenient of the three study areas, requiring a 1000-foot distance from schools and churches. Neither inconsistency poses much of a problem. There are presently no adult uses in Pine Island Ridge and there is no commercially zoned land to build future adult uses. Additionally, there are no single-family lots in Pine Island Ridge, that meet the minimum lot size requirement of both municipalities to house livestock.

## **Analysis of Fiscal Impacts**

This section compares the total costs of taxes and fees for all three study areas. Each of the taxes and fees identified are listed below with a comparison and discussion.

### ***Ad Valorem Taxes***

The appropriate ad valorem tax rate to be considered is the total amount to be levied on the taxpayers. This includes both operating ad valorem and debt service ad valorem rates. The rationale for inclusion of both tax rates is that the taxpayer must pay these rates on an annual basis. There is no distinction for the residents.

Highest - Town of Davie  
Mid level - City of Plantation  
Lowest - Broward County

At a millage rate of 6.0089, the Town of Davie has an ad valorem rate 67.5% higher than the City of Plantation and over 182% higher than for unincorporated Broward County. The City of Plantation has an ad valorem millage rate that is 68.1% higher than Broward County's. These figures indicate that the individual property owner will pay substantially more in ad valorem taxes in the Town of Davie than in the other jurisdictions.

### ***Garbage Fees***

The amount paid by each household for garbage and recycling service also varies in each jurisdiction. In each case, garbage service is provided by a franchise holder and a fee is established based on negotiations between the governing body and the franchisee.

Highest- Broward County  
Mid level - Town of Davie  
Lowest - City of Plantation

The City of Plantation has a slightly lower garbage fee than either of the other two jurisdictions. One possible reason is that the Town of Davie and Broward County have less dense development which may increase the service costs. The City of Plantation has a garbage rate that is 3.5% less than the Town of Davie and 25.9% less than Broward County. The City of Plantation also has a volume based fee structure. The rate for the Town of Davie is 21.7% less than the rate for Broward County.

### **Utility Taxes**

Utility Taxes are established as a percentage of the monthly service amount for each utility. (Electric, telephone, water, fuel oil and natural gas)

- Electric - all jurisdictions are equal at 10%
- Telephone - all jurisdictions are equal at 7%
- Water - all jurisdictions are equal at 0%
- Natural gas - the City of Plantation and Town of Davie are at 10% and Broward County is at 0%
- Fuel oil - the City of Plantation is at 10%, the other jurisdictions are at 0%

The City of Plantation and the Town of Davie both impose Utility Taxes on all but one of the various services. Broward County will impose the lowest amount of costs from Utility Taxes.

### **Franchise Fees**

Franchise Fees are similar to Utility Taxes in that the fees are levied as a percentage of the utility bill. Those utilities that are impacted in this study are: electric, telephone, cable TV, garbage and natural gas.

- Highest - the City of Plantation and the Town of Davie have the same level of Franchise Fees
- Lowest - Broward County with a lower fee for electric (5.5% as opposed to 6%) and no fee on telephone, garbage and natural gas

The two municipalities impose a higher amount of franchise fees on the households than does Broward County.

### **Fire/EMS Fees**

Broward County and the Town of Davie impose a separate fee for Fire and EMS services. The City of Plantation has no Fire/EMS fee.

- Highest - Broward County
- Mid level - Town of Davie
- Lowest - City of Plantation

The rate for the two municipalities is substantially less than the rate for Broward County. The reason for this fact is that the municipalities subsidize the Fire/EMS service costs through the ad valorem taxes. The City of Plantation also maintains a volunteer Fire Department and charges for EMS service on a user fee basis. A comparison of the fees charged does not offer a true analysis of the cost effectiveness of the service provided.

### **Total Cost**

Total cost to households is defined as the combination of ad valorem taxes, Utility Taxes, Franchise Fees, garbage rates and Fire/EMS fees.

For single-family and townhouse residences, the total taxes and fees cost for the City of Plantation is less than for the Town of Davie and Broward County, at all levels of Assessed Value. For the Town of Davie, the total cost of taxes and fees are less than for Broward County at Assessed values of \$50,000 or less. At all Assessed Values over \$50,000, Broward County is lower in total taxes and fees than the Town of Davie.

For condominium residences, the City of Plantation is less in taxes and fees than the Town of Davie at all levels of Assessed Value. The City of Plantation is also less than Broward County at all Assessed Value levels under \$200,000. The Town of Davie is less costly in total taxes and fees than Broward County for all levels of Assessed Value less than \$75,000.

The lower costs for Fire/EMS service and garbage rates combine to make the costs from the City of Plantation lower, from a tax and fee perspective, than the unincorporated portion of Broward County.

The Town of Davie has lower Fire/EMS and garbage fees than Broward County. However, the significantly higher ad valorem tax rates make living in the Town of Davie more costly than either the City of Plantation or the unincorporated portion of the County at Assessed Values over \$50,000. The ad valorem rate in the Town of Davie is 54% higher than in the City of Plantation and 182% higher than in unincorporated Broward County. The City of Plantation has the lowest Fire/EMS fees due to the nature of the department. User fees are charged for EMS service based on the type of service provided.

The total cost to each household is illustrated in Tables 4.2.4 through 4.2.12. These tables list the cost to the homeowners for all taxes and fees including ad valorem taxes, utility taxes, franchise fees, Fire/EMS fees and garbage fees. The tables list the costs based on Assessed Value of the home giving figures for all values with \$25,000 increments starting at \$25,000 and ending at \$200,000.

**Commercial Properties**

It is not possible to examine the total costs for commercial properties since the annual expenses for telephone and electric service are not available. Additionally, there are currently no commercial parcels in Pine Island Ridge, making any generalized comparison unrealistic. However, it is possible to compare the ad valorem taxes under each scenario. For the assessed value of the average commercial property, the ad valorem taxes in unincorporated Broward County are less than the two municipalities. The City of Plantation would also charge less in ad valorem taxes than the Town of Davie.

Table 4.4.1 in the main text lists the taxes generated by commercial/industrial property based on the various Assessed Values for the property. The table lists the comparison of the costs for the City of Plantation, the Town of Davie and Broward County.

**Revenues Generated by Pine Island Ridge**

| Source                 | Study Areas        |                    |                     |
|------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|---------------------|
|                        | City of Plantation | Town of Davie      | Broward County      |
| Ad valorem Taxes       | \$ 494,982         | \$ 828,958         | \$ 294,396          |
| Franchise Fees         | 261,395            | 261,395            | 243,149             |
| Utility Taxes          | 457,343            | 457,343            | 457,343             |
| Garbage Fees           | 289,066            | 299,065            | 364,096             |
| State Shared Revenues  | 403,788            | 403,788            | 403,788             |
| Fire/EMS Fees          | 0                  | 122,357            | 735,481             |
| Miscellaneous Revenues | 73,416             | 73,416             | 73,416              |
| <b>TOTAL</b>           | <b>\$1,979,990</b> | <b>\$2,446,322</b> | <b>\$ 2,571,669</b> |

Note: The figures listed here represent the aggregate of all housing units.  
 Source: PMG Associates, Inc.

### **Analysis of Capital Improvement Program**

Broward County has no capital improvement projects in their five-year Capital Improvement Plan for the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood. Neither the City of Plantation nor the Town of Davie have specific capital improvement projects that would affect Pine Island Ridge. However, the City of Plantation has developed a road resurfacing program which would extend into Pine Island Ridge, should the City annex the neighborhood, as well a program to eliminate septic and wells and improve drainage. Both municipalities, would consider capital improvement projects on public land in Pine Island Ridge should either annex the neighborhood. Presently, the Town of Davie is making median improvements to Pine Island Road adjacent to the Pine Island Ridge community.

## Level of Service Analysis

| Service / Utility         | Town of Davie                           |   | City of Plantation                      |  | Broward County   |  |
|---------------------------|---|---|---|--|--|--|
|                           | Standard                                | Actual                                    | Standard                                | Actual   | Standard   | Actual   |
| Drainage                  | Adopted FEMA standards                  | Designed to meet FEMA Standards           | Adopted FEMA standards                  | Designed to meet FEMA Standards                                | Designed to meet FEMA Standards                                      | N/A  |
| Potable Water             | 150 gallons per capita per day          | 206 gallons per capita per day            | 110 gallons per capita per day.         | 155 gallons per capita per day                                 | 110 gallons per day per person                                       | N/A  |
| Road Impacts              | LOS D                                   | 5 Roadways operating at a level of E or F | LOS D                                   | Several roadway segments are currently level of service E or F | LOS D  | LOS D  |
| Fire/EMS                  | No adopted standard.                    | Response time of 3 min ISO rating of 5*   | No adopted standard.                    | Response time 7 min fire, 4 min for medical ISO Rating of 3    | No adopted level of service  | Response time 8 min  |
| Police                    | No adopted standard.                    | 2.5 officers per 1000 population          | No adopted standard.                    | 2.36 sworn officers per 1000 population. Response time 3.5 min | No adopted level of service  | 5.1 deputy sheriffs per patrol zone                                  |
| Recreation and Open Space | 10 acres per 1000 population            | 15 acres per 1000 population              | 4 acres per 1000 population             | 4 acres per 1000 population                                    | 3 acres per 1000 population for both regional and neighborhood parks | 3 acres per 1000 population for both regional and neighborhood parks |
| Solid Waste               | 8.9 pounds per residential unit per day | 7.2 pounds per residential unit per day   | 8.9 pounds per day per residential unit | 8.9 pounds per day per residential unit                        | 8.9 pounds per day per residential unit                              | 8.9 pounds per day per residential unit                              |

Sources: Broward County 1997 Comprehensive Plan, City of Sunrise, Broward County Fire Rescue Division, Broward County Sheriff's Office, Plantation Police Department Annual Report, Plantation Fire Department, Davie Police Department, Davie Fire Department, City of Plantation Comprehensive Plan, Town of Davie Comprehensive Plan, Broward County Integrated Waste Management, Broward County Water Management

\*The ISO is the insurance rating indicating the level of service for Fire, 5 being the best rating, 1 being the worst.

### ***Drainage***

Central Broward WCD provides secondary drainage to Pine Island Ridge via the N-12 canal which flows into the South Florida Water Management District's (SFWMD's) C-11 canal between Orange and Griffin Roads. The system allows for drainage of 1 ½ inches of standing water per day, with stormwater management utilizing retention ponds and lakes. Service is paid for with ad valorem taxes per day at .50 mil based on the property value. Presently the Pine Island Ridge Country Club maintains all private drainage systems within the neighborhood. If annexed by the Town of Davie or the City of Plantation, the annexing municipalities would be responsible for maintaining drainage systems on county roads, not private roads. Private roads in Pine Island Ridge will continue to be maintained by a private company contracted by the Country Club.

### ***Water***

Broward County has adopted the Florida Department of Environmental Protection Permitted Capacity level of service standards for potable water facilities. Presently the City of Sunrise provides water to Pine Island Ridge with a 25% surcharge. Should annexation occur, residents of Pine Island Ridge will remain customers of the City of Sunrise and should expect no changes to rates or levels of service. This is counter to the Town of Davie's understanding that the rates would change if the Town chooses to annex Pine Island Ridge. It is also counter to the City of Plantation's contention that they would provide water to Pine Island Ridge if they annex the neighborhood. According to the City of Sunrise, Pine Island Ridge is in the City of Sunrise's jurisdiction. Therefore, it would be illegal for any other agency to serve Pine Island Ridge for water.

### ***Road Impacts***

Broward County maintains the streets for Pine Island Ridge at a cost of \$5,000 per lane mile. Verification with FDOT indicates that figure could be as high as \$6,500. In the case of annexation, transfer of road ownership would be subject to mutual agreement. Typically, arterials will remain under County ownership, however, the cost of maintenance should be constant. Additionally, all roads in Broward County have an adopted level of service of "D". However, if Pine Island Ridge were annexed by the Town of Davie or the City of Plantation, the level of service for roadways would not change. There are no plans to improve Pine Island Ridge roads by Broward County.

### ***Fire/EMS***

Broward County is leaving fire rescue for Pine Island Ridge to the Town of Davie once the Nob Hill Road station is completed in April 1999. Operating expenses are covered by the annual special assessment of \$226.82 which includes \$30.82 for EMS. The City of Plantation has a volunteer fire department and a paid EMS department. If the City of Plantation annexes Pine Island Ridge, it could be difficult to provide adequate response times given the distance between Pine Island Ridge and Plantation. Additionally, it takes a longer amount of time to assemble volunteer firefighters. The Town of Davie will be opening a new Police / Fire / EMS station on Nob Hill Road, adjacent to the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood, in April of 1999. This station could adequately service the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood if annexed by the Town of Davie and is currently scheduled to take over the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood for Broward County.

### ***Police***

The Broward County Sheriff's Office uses a community based philosophy for a more holistic approach to policing. Therefore, level of service is measured by how well deputies can solve problems in neighborhoods, not by average response times. Pine Island Ridge is one of 810 patrol zones in Broward County. It is connected to the District Eight/Weston-West Broward office. In addition, the County contracts with six municipalities and four County agencies to provide police services. This fortifies the County's comprehensive approach to policing. Each patrol zone is staffed by 5.1 deputy sheriffs at a cost of \$70,000 per deputy sheriff for a total of \$357,000 for each patrol zone. This does not account for ancillary support services. The average response time for all calls and services in unincorporated areas is 5 minutes and 15 seconds, accounting for both emergency and non-emergency calls.

### ***Parks***

Broward County provides three acres of neighborhood and regional parks for every thousand people. The distinction between regional and neighborhood refers to countywide parks and parks serving unincorporated neighborhoods. Pine Island Ridge contains a twenty-acre regional park, the Pine Island Ridge Conservation Area, which is considered a natural conservation area. The County imposes impact fees when residential development occurs. However, the Ridge is leased to the Pine Island Ridge Country Club by the Sun First National Bank of Lake Wales, Trustee for 99 years and does not fall under county ownership.

### **Solid Waste**

The level of service standard for Broward County is 8.9 pounds per residential unit per day. The County does not presently measure the actual level of service, therefore, this information is not available for the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood. Broward County contracts solid waste collection and disposal for the unincorporated neighborhoods to private companies. Three such companies service Pine Island Ridge at a cost of \$297 a year. Service includes garbage pick-up twice a week, once-a-week recycling, and monthly bulk pick-up in addition to a drop-off station. Both potential annexing municipalities have solid waste disposal providers which are different from Pine Island Ridge's. Therefore, should the neighborhood be annexed by the City of Plantation or the Town of Davie, the franchise serving Pine Island Ridge could maintain service for five years or until the contract expires as long as the contract has been in effect for at least six months and the quality and frequency of service is equivalent to that of the annexing municipality's.

### **Fire, Police, EMS Comparative Analysis**

Presently, the City of Plantation's police department divides the City into patrol zones. According to Chief Sharrett, Jr., Pine Island Ridge would need to be made a patrol zone, if annexed by the City of Plantation. The number of patrol cars required to service the area would reflect the frequency and number of service calls in the area. Presently, there are sufficient officers to adequately police Pine Island Ridge. Expanding a zone typically requires 4.5 police officers for 24-hour coverage. Pine Island Ridge may require a zone and a half and, consequently, six additional officers. The investigative and support staff should be able to absorb Pine Island Ridge without immediately adding additional staff, however, should there be a need to increase staff, the Plantation Police Department would consider adding staff. The Plantation Police Department is unaware of the actual work load Pine Island Ridge might generate. In addition to investigative and support staff, all community oriented efforts and programs provided by the City of Plantation Police Department would be made available to Pine Island Ridge residents should they be annexed by the City of Plantation.

The Town of Davie employs 2.5 police officers for every 1000 population. Given the population of Pine Island Ridge, the Town of Davie would add 14 officers if the Town annexes the neighborhood. Additionally, the Town of Davie would assign a police officer, and patrol car, to the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood at all times. In April, 1999, the Town of Davie will open a fully equipped police / fire / EMS station at the corner of State Road 84 and Nob Hill Road. This 37,000-square foot facility which will sit adjacent to the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood, will significantly improve response times to three minutes and provide room for 10,000 to 20,000 square feet of expansion. The station will be equipped with five fire trucks, one aerial platform, with an average of three people on duty per fire

vehicle. In addition, the Insurance Service Organization (ISO) rating which indicates level of service quality, will remain at 5, the highest possible rating. This service station was planned, in part, because Broward County is turning over fire, EMS, and police responsibilities for Pine Island Ridge to the Town of Davie. Therefore, this service station will be provided at no cost to the Pine Island Ridge community.

According to Fire Chief Robert S. Pudney, the City of Plantation Fire and Emergency Medical Services would meet the existing citywide service levels should the City annex Pine Island Ridge. The closest fire station to the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood is located at 8200 SW 3 St. at the 300 block of Pine Island Road. It is equipped with a fire engine and one medical rescue unit. The fire department typically sends 42 firefighters, eight apparatus, three fire engines, one medical rescue, one command officer and one aerial apparatus per call with an average response time of 6.5 minutes. The average EMS response time is 4 minutes.

### **City Staff and Services**

The following section answers specific questions asked by Pine Island Ridge residents. They were answered as a result of interviews with the City of Plantation's Finance Director and the Town of Davie's Budget and Finance Director and Programs Administrator.

*1. Identify the agency responsible for lake and canal maintenance.*

The City of Plantation Public Works is responsible for spraying public lakes and canals in the City. The homeowners are responsible for any additional maintenance and all private lakes and canals. The Town of Davie does not provide maintenance for canals and lakes.

*2. Identify the entity responsible for environmental maintenance/preservation of Pine Island Ridge after annexation and how the environmental protection may be implemented.*

The Ridge is leased to the Pine Island Ridge Country Club by Sun Trust Bank of Lake Wales, Trustee for 99 years. Therefore, it would be difficult for either municipality to impose development restrictions on the property, though the Town of Davie would seek to purchase the ridge to protect and maintain it.

*3. Determine the probable level of nature of code enforcement officers and the anticipated frequency of inspections.*

The Town of Davie does not see Pine Island Ridge as a code enforcement problem and would not add any more code enforcers to staff.

The City of Plantation would, however, assess the need to add more staff and is concerned there would be an insufficient response time.

*4. Identify the agency responsible for roads, medians, streetlights, roadside landscaping, and irrigation systems.*

The Public Works Department is responsible for public roads, medians, streetlights, roadside landscaping, and irrigation systems for both the Town of Davie and the City of Plantation. If the roads are public then public works crews would be responsible for maintaining the facilities.

*5. Identify the potential annexing municipality's ability and capacity to provide neighborhood planning services and assistance in obtaining grant monies.*

In both the Town of Davie and the City of Plantation, individual departments prepare and submit their own grants. The City of Plantation will be hiring a grant administrator in the future and would consider adding planning staff. The Town of Davie, however, would not hire additional planning staff.

*6. Identify and describe the potential annexing municipalities programs for youth recreation after school care, day care, senior programs, and programs for the disabled populations, including transportation.*

The City of Plantation provides special youth recreation programs, though there are no after school programs and few programs for the elderly and handicapped population. However, the City would consider providing additional programs at the request of Pine Island Ridge. The Town of Davie has an extensive array of youth and elderly recreation programs. This includes weekly transportation services to the grocery store for elderly residents, clinics and classes, after school programs, and summer camp.

*7. Explore the issue of the potential annexing municipalities agreeing to allow Pine Island Ridge to become a private, gated community with streets returned to private (community) ownership.*

The City of Plantation and the Town of Davie would permit Pine Island Ridge to become a gated community, however all streets would become private and, therefore, the responsibility of Pine Island Ridge. Pine Island Ridge would be responsible for all maintenance and improvements to roads, medians, streetlights, landscaping, sidewalks and irrigation systems.

*8. Determine the entities responsible for maintaining streets and sidewalks.*

In both the Town of Davie and the City of Plantation, the Public Works Departments, in conjunction with the homeowners, are responsible for maintaining public streets and sidewalks.

9. *Explore the issue of the potential annexing municipalities' imposition of beautification or other improvement projects on the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood and if the cost of such programs would be borne by the annexing municipality as a whole, or the Pine Island Ridge neighborhood.*

The City of Plantation has several beautification programs which would be available to Pine Island Ridge should it be annexed:

1. Street Beautification Program, the City pays half the costs of median improvements, and
2. Entryway Improvements, the City pays half the cost of private entryway improvements, but must be approved by the City Council, provided there is a public easement.

The Town of Davie provides beautification and other improvements on public property including median improvements however, the Town will not take over the general maintenance of Pine Island Ridge.

10. *The likelihood and status of the following projects:*

(a) *landscaping for noise abatement and beautification on the north side of SW 24<sup>th</sup> Street;*

(b) *buffering along Evergreen Place from new construction west of Evergreen Place;*

(c) *median improvements on Pine Island Road from SR 84 south to Nova Drive; and,*

(d) *landscaping improvements at all four entrances to Pine Island Ridge.*

Both the City of Plantation and the Town of Davie would examine the need for using landscaping for noise abatement and beautification on the north side of SW 24<sup>th</sup> Street. The Town of Davie would also look into buffering along Evergreen Place from new construction west of Evergreen Place, though the City of Plantation anticipates there may not be enough space for landscaping, especially if the Town of Davie is not supportive of these improvements. The Town of Davie is currently planning to make median improvements along Pine Island Road from SR 84 to Nova Drive and the City of Plantation would make the same median improvements as part of its Street Beautification Program.

Similarly, the City of Plantation would make landscape improvements to all four entrances to Pine Island Ridge as part of its Entryway Improvement Program. The Town of Davie has provided neighborhood improvements to communities and would evaluate the possibility of providing landscape improvements to the four entrances as long as they are on public property. In all scenarios, the Pine Island Ridge community must approve all site plans.

11. *Will the Pine Island Ridge Homeowners Association have the power to approve all plans for site improvement projects?*

Neither the Town of Davie nor the City of Plantation would give Pine Island Ridge Country Club the power to approve or reject site plans and site plan improvements within the Pine Island Ridge Neighborhood. However, public input is encouraged by both municipalities and the City of Plantation allows individuals to serve on various site review boards.

## Public Policy

Perhaps one of the more dramatic effects of annexation are the changes in government structure. The City of Plantation would add 6.2% registered voters to its registered voter population, but would not necessarily change its government structure unless the residents of Pine Island Ridge initiated a Charter Review Board. According to the Town of Davie's town charter, the Town must review the district boundaries and recommend district boundary changes if the Town's geographical boundaries change by ten percent or more or if a single annexation causes its population to increase by five percent or more.

All three study areas have a higher percentage of registered democrats, but Pine Island Ridge clearly had the highest. The following table shows the breakdown of registered voters in each of the three study areas:

| Party Affiliation | Study Areas       |                |                    |                 |
|-------------------|-------------------|----------------|--------------------|-----------------|
|                   | Pine Island Ridge | Town of Davie  | City of Plantation | Broward County  |
| Democratic Party  | 2,329 (57.9%)     | 16,586 (45.1%) | 23,555 (48.4%)     | 427,762 (52.2%) |
| Republican Party  | 1,121 (27.9%)     | 13,803 (37.5%) | 17,165 (35.2%)     | 262,090 (32.0%) |
| Other Party       | 569 (14.2%)       | 6,380 (17.4%)  | 7,990 (16.4%)      | 129,995 (15.9%) |

Source: Broward County Supervisor of Elections, 1/14/99.