

**Unincorporated Broward County
Annexation Study**

North Andrews Gardens Study Area

Executive Summary

The purpose of this study is to provide relevant, timely information to the residents of the North Andrews Gardens Area to assist in deciding into which municipality this neighborhood would prefer to incorporate. The adjacent municipalities eligible to annex the North Andrews Gardens Area are the City of Fort Lauderdale and the City of Oakland Park. This report provides information related to municipal services, fiscal considerations, capital improvement projects, municipal ordinances and regulations and specific issues relevant to the Area. Figure 1 depicts the North Andrews Gardens Area and the potential annexing municipalities and is located at the end of this summary.

I. Demographic Data

According to the U.S. Census, the North Andrews Gardens Area had a population of 9,002 in 1990, while the City of Fort Lauderdale's population was 149,377 and the City of Oakland Park's was 26,326. The North Andrews Gardens Area had a larger percentage of children, 17 and younger, than both the City of Fort Lauderdale and the City of Oakland Park, which would suggest a higher percentage of families in the North Andrews Gardens Area. Ethnically, the North Andrews Gardens Area was relatively less diverse compared to the City of Fort Lauderdale and the City of Oakland Park with 83.4 percent of its population white and only 1.0 percent black.

The North Andrews Gardens Area also experienced lower unemployment in 1990, with a 3.4 percent unemployment rate, as compared to the City of Fort Lauderdale's 6.7 percent and the City of Oakland Park's 4.6 percent. Furthermore, the North Andrews Gardens Area experienced the lowest rate of total poverty (6.6%) as compared to the City of Fort Lauderdale (16.6%) and the City of Oakland Park (10.2%). This could be attributed to the neighborhood's low unemployment rate.

Housing in the North Andrews Gardens Area is homogenous with 95.6 percent of its housing stock single-family. In addition, this neighborhood reported the lowest percentage of vacant housing units and almost no seasonal units in 1990, as compared to the City of Fort Lauderdale and the City of Oakland Park. The City of Fort Lauderdale housing stock varied in valuation as compared to the North Andrews Gardens Area and the City of Oakland Park with a substantially larger percentage of homes valued at \$299,000 or above. Although the City of Oakland Park also varied in valuation, the highest percentages of homes were valued between \$75,000 and \$99,999. Most of the housing stock in the North Andrews Gardens Area was valued between \$50,000 and \$74,999 (71.6%).

Population projections for the year 2000 indicate if the North Andrews Gardens Area is annexed by the City of Fort Lauderdale, it would constitute only 5.6 percent of the total population. However, if annexation into the City of Oakland Park occurs, the North Andrews Gardens Area residents would constitute 24.4 percent of the total city population.

II. Land Use and Zoning

A review and comparison of the Future Land Use Plan Designations of both Cities' adopted Comprehensive Plans was undertaken. Results indicated both Cities' land use designations could be utilized without modification in the North Andrews Gardens Area. This could be accomplished through an amendment to the municipal comprehensive plans.

The City of Fort Lauderdale Zoning

The City of Fort Lauderdale has indicated that the following two options are available to the North Andrews Gardens Area concerning zoning regulations:

1. The zoning of Broward County shall be deemed the conforming laws of the municipality until such time that City zoning can be agreed as noted below.
2. Implementation of City Zoning would be contingent on both the municipality and the area to be annexed agreeing to said implementation.

The City of Oakland Park Zoning

The City of Oakland Park has indicated that in the event of annexation, the transition to City land use and zoning would most likely be handled through a City initiated area-wide future land use amendment and rezoning study and analysis. The City's code requires that whenever unincorporated, or incorporated areas of Broward County are annexed to the City of Oakland Park, the lands shall be zoned to the closest applicable City zoning at the time of annexation. The City has not, as of yet, established a policy as to how non-conforming uses will be treated. However, variations related to allowable uses, hours of operation and parking will be handled on a case by case basis.

III. Vacant Property Inventory

Six vacant properties were identified in the North Andrews Gardens Area. Of these properties, five are zoned Residential, limiting any new construction to single-family homes, daycare, community residential facilities, not for profit social/recreational facilities, and accessory uses such as sheds. Home offices and yard sales are currently allowed under certain conditions.

The sixth property, located at the corner of Andrews Avenue and Commercial Boulevard, is zoned Neighborhood Business and is intended to provide commercial uses for the surrounding community. A number of office, residential and retail uses are allowed under the current designation.

IV. Municipal Sign Regulations

The City of Fort Lauderdale passed an ordinance on June 18, 1997, prohibiting new outdoor advertising display signs and billboards. Existing legal billboards are required to landscape or screen from residential areas.

The City of Oakland Park has also passed an ordinance prohibiting off-site commercial signs, with the exception of bus shelter or bench signs and temporary project signs. Existing legal billboards shall be removed in accordance with an amortization schedule based on value of the sign.

V. Fiscal Impact Analysis

Millage rates, taxes, fees and assessment rates of Unincorporated Broward County were compared with those of the City of Fort Lauderdale and the City of Oakland Park. It was determined that overall, residents of Unincorporated Broward County pay the lowest franchise fees and property taxes with a millage rate of 2.1340. However, Unincorporated residents also pay the highest Fire/EMS assessment. Between the two Cities, the City of Oakland Park has the lowest millage rate at 4.9715, while the City of Fort Lauderdale's millage rate is 5.6733. For the purpose of comparison, generalized expenditure figures of \$120 per month for electric, \$30 per month for telephone and \$27 per month for cable were assumed to calculate franchise fees and utility taxes. Analysis of these taxes, fees and assessments indicated that residents of the North Andrews Garden Area would pay a lower aggregate amount of total taxes and fees to local government if the City of Oakland Park annexes the area. Table V.1 below, summarizes these taxes, fees and assessments on an annual basis.

Table V.1
Summary Comparison of Municipal Residential Costs

	Unincorporated Broward County	The City of Fort Lauderdale	The City of Oakland Park
Tax/Fee/Assessment			
Ad Valorem Taxes ¹	\$106.80	\$283.92	\$258.76
Utility Tax ²	169.20	202.08	185.64
Franchise Fees ²	95.40	106.20	106.20
Fire/EMS Assessment	237.38	30.38*	0.00*
Services Fees			
Solid Waste	297.00	340.80	266.40
Water ³	329.04	329.04	329.04
Sewer ³	381.96	381.96	381.96
Stormwater	0.00	26.88	36.00
Total	\$1616.78	\$1701.26	\$1564.00

Source: Broward County; Cities of Fort Lauderdale and Oakland Park; Miami Economic Associates, Inc.

¹Assumes average residential unit value of \$50,039

²Fees/taxes assessed on Electric, Telephone, Water, Fuel Oil and Natural Gas.

³Based on consumption rate of 9,000 gallons/month. Also assumes ¾ inch meter.

*Fire/EMS services are fully or partially funded through ad valorem taxes.

Table V.2 illustrates the total taxes, fees and assessments that residents of the North Andrews Gardens Area will pay to all governmental entities including the ad valorem taxes that are paid to Broward County for countywide obligations, the School Board and certain specialized agencies of government. The combined millage rate for the ad valorem taxes paid to Broward County for countywide obligations, the School Board and the other governmental agencies is 20.5406. This portion of the ad valorem taxes paid will not vary regardless of whether the area remains unincorporated or is annexed by either the City of Fort Lauderdale or the City of Oakland Park.

**Table V.2
Residential Costs**

Unit Taxable Value	Unincorporated Broward County		The City of Fort Lauderdale		The City of Oakland Park	
	Municipal	Total	Municipal	Total	Municipal	Total
\$0	\$1,511	\$1,511	\$1,417	\$1,417	\$1,305	\$1,305
\$25,000	\$1,564	\$2,077	\$1,559	\$2,072	\$1,430	\$1,943
\$50,000	\$1,617	\$2,644	\$1,701	\$2,728	\$1,554	\$2,581
\$75,000	\$1,671	\$3,211	\$1,842	\$3,383	\$1,678	\$3,219
\$100,000	\$1,724	\$3,778	\$1,984	\$4,038	\$1,802	\$3,856
\$125,000	\$1,777	\$4,345	\$2,126	\$4,694	\$1,927	\$4,494
\$150,000	\$1,831	\$4,912	\$2,268	\$5,349	\$2,051	\$5,132
\$175,000	\$1,884	\$5,479	\$2,410	\$6,004	\$2,175	\$5,770
\$200,000	\$1,937	\$6,046	\$2,552	\$6,660	\$2,300	\$6,408
\$225,000	\$1,991	\$6,612	\$2,693	\$7,315	\$2,424	\$7,045
\$250,000	\$2,044	\$7,179	\$2,835	\$7,970	\$2,548	\$7,683

Source: Broward County; Cities of Fort Lauderdale and Oakland Park; Miami Economic Associates, Inc.

Commercial properties vary greatly in terms of their usage of electric, phone, water, sewer and sanitation services depending on the nature and value of the property and the business use housed within the property. In comparative terms, owners of commercial properties and/or businesses in the North Andrews Garden Area will likely pay less to government if the City of Oakland Park annexes the area rather than the City of Fort Lauderdale because the City of Oakland Park has lower millage rate. It also has a lower water utility tax and no Fire/EMS assessments.

As of September 30, 1997, the City of Fort Lauderdale had a total outstanding long-term debt on non-revenue generating funds approximating \$101.06 million. During Fiscal Year (FY) 98, the City paid \$13.091 million in debt service. Since September 30, 1998, the City has increased its debt obligation by \$11.2 million. The City of Oakland Park, as of September 30, 1997, had a total outstanding long-term debt on non-revenue generating funds totaling \$401,617. During FY 98, the debt service on this totaled \$196,033. By September 30, 2000, the City expects to have all outstanding debt retired.

In the event that new facilities were to be proposed in the North Andrews Gardens Area after it is annexed, the City of Oakland Park does not currently levy special assessments. However, the City of Fort Lauderdale has indicated that the cost of new facilities would be assessed to the benefiting property owner.

VI. Capital Improvement Projects

Broward County has committed, through its Capital Program, to the installation of significant capital improvements totaling approximately \$65 million in expenditures by the year 2003. These capital projects are primarily related to the provision of potable water, sanitary sewer and drainage improvements. In addition, enhancements such as the installation of sidewalks, landscaping and renovation of community and recreation facilities are also included the scope of these improvements.

It should be of primary importance to the North Andrews Gardens Area residents that these improvements, which will improve the health, safety and welfare of the area as well enhance property values, be implemented. To this end the Broward County Commission has established policies designed to assure that these improvements continue to be implemented during and after the municipal annexation process. Specifically, this policy states:

“An interlocal agreement should be developed between the County and the annexing municipality and executed prior to the effective date of the annexation. The agreement should include a financially feasible plan for transitioning services, infrastructure and County employees, and provisions for the County to continue to receive certain revenues generated by the neighborhood until the completion of programmed infrastructure improvements”

Given the significance of the present Broward County Capital Program commitment, it is essential, for the betterment of the community, that interlocal agreements be executed with the annexing municipality in accordance with the above stated policy prior to annexation.

VII. Adopted Levels of Service Standards

Both of the potential annexing municipalities and Broward County are in conformance with the Local Government Comprehensive Planning and Land Development Regulation Act. A review and comparison of the adopted level of service standards indicates that adoption of either of the municipalities' LOS standards would not result in any concurrency conflicts. The City of Oakland Park has indicated that if it assumed responsibility for the treatment of the area's sanitary sewer flows the County would have to assign additional plant capacity to the City. This could be accomplished through the pre-annexation interlocal or other agreements. Currently the area south of Commercial Boulevard is within the City of Oakland Park water service area. However, the County is negotiating to purchase that service. Broward County provides water and sewer service to the remainder of the North Andrews Gardens Area and will continue to do so regardless of annexation outcome.

The following table summarizes solid waste disposal services:

	Broward County	Fort Lauderdale	Oakland Park
<i>Garbage Pickup</i>	Twice weekly	Twice weekly (65 gal. cart)	Twice weekly (96 gal cart)
<i>Yard Waste Pickup</i>	With garbage and/or Bulk Waste	Once weekly (90 gal. cart)	-----
<i>Recycling Pickup</i>	Once weekly	Once weekly	Once weekly
<i>Bulk Trash Pickup</i>	Once monthly	Once monthly (10 cu. yds.)	FY 98/99 Once bi-monthly FY 2000 Once monthly

VIII. Police, Fire and EMS

Currently the North Andrews Gardens Area receives police services from the Broward Sheriff's Office (BSO), which operates a police substation out of the area. The North Andrews Gardens community represents a dedicated patrol zone, which is staffed by five uniformed deputy sheriffs. The zone is also supported by supervisory and investigative staff with other unincorporated neighborhoods in the vicinity. BSO has indicated that in the event of annexation, this office space will be returned to the County Parks and Recreation Division and BSO will no longer provide services unless the North Andrews Gardens Area retains police service from BSO. The following table is a comparison of police services.

POLICE			
	Fort Lauderdale	Oakland Park	Broward County
<i>Response Times</i>	8.2 Minutes*	7.9 Minutes*	3 Minutes**
<i>Personnel</i>	12 Patrol Officers 2 Detectives 1 DARE Officer 4 Public Service Aides	5 Patrol Officers 1 Detective 1 Clerical Staff	5 Deputy Sheriffs
<i>Equipment</i>	9 Vehicles 19 Computers	1 Vehicle	5 Vehicles
<i>Estimated Cost</i>	\$1,424,800***	\$385,000***	\$378,000.00

*Average for emergency and non-emergency police responses.

**Emergency calls only.

***Includes initial capital outlay.

Current fire service is provided by the Broward County Fire Rescue Station #20. The medical/rescue unit is staffed by two full-time paramedics providing emergency medical service to the area. A fully staffed Advanced Life Support engine company also responds to emergency calls.

Fire services are ranked by the Insurance Services Office, Inc. (ISO), which is an independent statistical, rating and advisory organization that serves the property and casualty insurance industry. A community's fire protection is ranked on a scale from 1 to 10, with 1 being the highest level of public protection. ISO ratings are included in the following table.

FIRE/EMS			
	Fort Lauderdale	Oakland Park	Broward County
<i>Response Times</i>	7.03 Minutes	3.3 Minutes	5.03 Minutes
<i>ISO Rating</i> ¹	3	5	3
<i>Personnel</i>	2 firefighter/paramedics per shift	2 firefighter/paramedics per shift 1 lieutenant/paramedic per shift	2 paramedics 1 paramedic/firefighter 1 fire officer 1 firefighter 1 driver engineer
<i>Equipment</i>	1 Rescue Unit	1 Apparatus 1 Fire Station	1 Medical/Rescue Unit 1 Advanced Life Support Engine
<i>Estimated Cost</i>	\$562,900	\$730,000	\$1.5 million

¹ Insurance Services Offices, Inc.

IX. Municipal Staff and Services

Both the City of Fort Lauderdale and the City of Oakland Park actively participate in securing Community Development Block Grants, which are allocated based on eligibility and greatest need. In addition, the City of Oakland Park has also secured funding through the Florida Recreation Development Assistance Program, which is currently funding park improvements in the City.

General beautification programs available to residents in the City of Fort Lauderdale include the Neighborhood Capital Improvement Program and the Business Capital Improvement Program. These programs provide funds for neighborhood or business improvements that will enhance the overall appearance or quality of life in a neighborhood. The City of Oakland Park is developing a program to provide assistance for neighborhood entryway beautification.

Both Cities' Parks and Recreation Divisions provide a number of programs for persons of all ages. Youth and adult sports programs include softball, tennis, and fitness programs such as martial arts, swimming and aerobics. Other recreation programs open to those of all ages are arts and crafts. Programs specifically targeted to seniors include the City of Oakland Park's "Busy Bees" program or the City of Fort Lauderdale's "Keenager" program. Other programs offered by the City of Fort Lauderdale include cooking, movies, dance lessons, golf and card games and street hockey. In addition, both the City of Oakland Park and the City of Fort Lauderdale offer after school care and summer child-care, for a fee

Broward County Parks and Recreation Division leases and maintains the athletic facilities at Northeast High School from the School Board of Broward County. This is accomplished through an interlocal agreement with Broward County, the School Board and the City of Oakland Park. The athletic fields are used by independent athletic leagues in the North Andrews Gardens Area and the City of Oakland Park. In addition, the City of Oakland Park operates an aquatics program from that location. According to Broward County, if annexation occurs, it would either be up to the annexing municipality to take over the County's responsibility or, the County might continue its lease and maintenance of the fields and enter into an interlocal agreement with the annexing municipality. In the event of annexation, the City of Oakland Park will continue to cooperate with the existing athletic leagues in the North Andrews Gardens Area. The City of Fort Lauderdale will coordinate with these leagues to ensure there is no duplication of City programs, but would allow the leagues to apply for permits to continue use of the athletic fields.

X. Traffic Circulation Policies

Both the City of Fort Lauderdale and the City of Oakland Park have developed agreements with Broward County to maintain traffic control signs and markings. Traffic calming devices and street modification are also used by both Cities. The City of Fort Lauderdale allocated \$500,000 for traffic calming devices in the 98/99 budget. The City of Oakland Park has developed a set of procedures for neighborhood groups to apply for modifications to local streets in residential areas. However, according to Section 18-5 of the City of Oakland Park Code of Ordinances, the applicant shall be responsible for all costs.

XI. Public Policy Issues

Both the Cities of Fort Lauderdale and the City of Oakland Park are operated under a City Commission/City Manager form of government. However, commissioners in the City of Oakland Park are elected citywide, while in the City of Fort Lauderdale, only the mayor is elected citywide, and commissioners are elected by district. In the event of annexation it would not be necessary to redistrict in the City of Oakland Park, since there are no districts. However, the City of Fort Lauderdale, has not yet determined whether annexed areas will be incorporated into existing districts, or if redistricting will occur. If the City incorporates the North Andrews Gardens Area into an existing district, it would most likely be into Commissioner Gloria Katz, District I, as illustrated on the following map.

A breakdown of registered voters in the North Andrews Gardens Area and the adjacent Cities indicate that there are 4,874 registered voters in the neighborhood. If annexed by the City of Fort Lauderdale, registered voters in the North Andrews Gardens Area would constitute 5.5 percent of total registered voters. If annexed by the City of Oakland Park, registered voters would constitute 25.2 percent.

XII. Public School Issues

The act of annexation into either of the eligible municipalities will not, in and of itself cause the reassignment of students residing in the area. A separate and distinct annual boundary process based on School Board criteria and policies determines which school students will attend without consideration of municipal boundaries.